

West Michigan Shoreline Regional Development Commission

**SINGLE AUDIT OF FEDERAL  
FINANCIAL ASSISTANCE PROGRAMS**

Financial Report and  
Independent Auditor's Reports

September 30, 2023



## CONTENTS

### FINANCIAL REPORT AND INDEPENDENT AUDITOR'S REPORTS

#### INTERNAL CONTROL AND COMPLIANCE REPORTS

INDEPENDENT AUDITOR'S REPORT ON INTERNAL CONTROL OVER FINANCIAL REPORTING AND ON COMPLIANCE AND OTHER MATTERS BASED ON AN AUDIT OF FINANCIAL STATEMENTS PERFORMED IN ACCORDANCE WITH <i>GOVERNMENT AUDITING STANDARDS</i> .....	1
---	---

INDEPENDENT AUDITOR'S REPORT ON COMPLIANCE FOR EACH MAJOR FEDERAL PROGRAM; REPORT ON INTERNAL CONTROL OVER COMPLIANCE; AND REPORT ON SCHEDULE OF EXPENDITURES OF FEDERAL AWARDS REQUIRED BY THE UNIFORM GUIDANCE.....	3
--	---

SCHEDULE OF EXPENDITURES OF FEDERAL AWARDS.....	6
---	---

NOTES TO SCHEDULE OF EXPENDITURES OF FEDERAL AWARDS.....	9
--	---

SCHEDULE OF FINDINGS AND QUESTIONED COSTS.....	10
--	----

#### CLIENT DOCUMENTS

SUMMARY SCHEDULE OF PRIOR AUDIT FINDINGS .....	12
--	----

CORRECTIVE ACTION PLAN .....	13
------------------------------	----

**INDEPENDENT AUDITOR'S REPORT ON INTERNAL CONTROL OVER  
FINANCIAL REPORTING AND ON COMPLIANCE AND OTHER MATTERS  
BASED ON AN AUDIT OF FINANCIAL STATEMENTS PERFORMED  
IN ACCORDANCE WITH *GOVERNMENT AUDITING STANDARDS***

Board of Commissioners  
West Michigan Shoreline Regional Development Commission  
Muskegon, Michigan

We have audited, in accordance with the auditing standards generally accepted in the United States of America and the standards applicable to financial audits contained in *Government Auditing Standards* issued by the Comptroller General of the United States (*Government Auditing Standards*), the financial statements of the governmental activities, and the major fund, and the aggregate remaining fund information of West Michigan Shoreline Regional Development Commission as of and for the year ended September 30, 2023, and the related notes to the financial statements, which collectively comprise West Michigan Shoreline Regional Development Commission's basic financial statements, and have issued our report thereon dated January 18, 2024.

**Report on Internal Control Over Financial Reporting**

In planning and performing our audit of the financial statements, we considered West Michigan Shoreline Regional Development Commission's internal control over financial reporting (internal control) as a basis for designing audit procedures that are appropriate in the circumstances for the purpose of expressing our opinions on the financial statements, but not for the purpose of expressing an opinion on the effectiveness of West Michigan Shoreline Regional Development Commission's internal control. Accordingly, we do not express an opinion on the effectiveness of West Michigan Shoreline Regional Development Commission's internal control.

*A deficiency in internal control* exists when the design or operation of a control does not allow management or employees, in the normal course of performing their assigned functions, to prevent, or detect and correct, misstatements on a timely basis. *A material weakness* is a deficiency, or a combination of deficiencies, in internal control, such that there is a reasonable possibility that a material misstatement of the entity's financial statements will not be prevented, or detected and corrected, on a timely basis. *A significant deficiency* is a deficiency, or a combination of deficiencies, in internal control that is less severe than a material weakness, yet important enough to merit attention by those charged with governance.

Our consideration of internal control was for the limited purpose described in the first paragraph of this section and was not designed to identify all deficiencies in internal control that might be material weaknesses or significant deficiencies. Given these limitations, during our audit, we did not identify any deficiencies in internal control that we consider to be material weaknesses. However, material weaknesses or significant deficiencies may exist that were not identified.

Board of Commissioners  
West Michigan Shoreline Regional Development Commission  
Page 2

**Report on Compliance and Other Matters**

As part of obtaining reasonable assurance about whether West Michigan Shoreline Regional Development Commission's financial statements are free from material misstatement, we performed tests of its compliance with certain provisions of laws, regulations, contracts, and grant agreements, noncompliance with which could have a direct and material effect on the financial statements. However, providing an opinion on compliance with those provisions was not an objective of our audit, and accordingly, we do not express such an opinion. The results of our tests disclosed no instances of noncompliance or other matters that are required to be reported under *Government Auditing Standards*.

**Purpose of this Report**

The purpose of this report is solely to describe the scope of our testing of internal control and compliance and the results of that testing, and not to provide an opinion on the effectiveness of the entity's internal control or on compliance. This report is an integral part of an audit performed in accordance with *Government Auditing Standards* in considering the entity's internal control and compliance. Accordingly, this communication is not suitable for any other purpose.

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Brickley DeLong, P.C." The signature is written in a cursive, flowing style.

Muskegon, Michigan  
January 18, 2024

**INDEPENDENT AUDITOR'S REPORT ON COMPLIANCE FOR EACH MAJOR FEDERAL PROGRAM; REPORT ON INTERNAL CONTROL OVER COMPLIANCE; AND REPORT ON SCHEDULE OF EXPENDITURES OF FEDERAL AWARDS REQUIRED BY THE UNIFORM GUIDANCE**

Board of Commissioners  
West Michigan Shoreline Regional Development Commission  
Muskegon, Michigan

**Report on Compliance for Each Major Federal Program**

***Opinion on Each Major Federal Program***

We have audited West Michigan Shoreline Regional Development Commission's compliance with the types of compliance requirements identified as subject to audit in the OMB *Compliance Supplement* that could have a direct and material effect on each of West Michigan Shoreline Regional Development Commission's major federal programs for the year ended September 30, 2023. West Michigan Shoreline Regional Development Commission's major federal programs are identified in the Summary of Auditor's Results section of the accompanying Schedule of Findings and Questioned Costs.

In our opinion, West Michigan Shoreline Regional Development Commission complied, in all material respects, with the compliance requirements referred to above that could have a direct and material effect on each of its major federal programs for the year ended September 30, 2023.

***Basis for Opinion on Each Major Federal Program***

We conducted our audit of compliance in accordance with auditing standards generally accepted in the United States of America (GAAS); the standards applicable to financial audits contained in *Government Auditing Standards* issued by the Comptroller General of the United States (*Government Auditing Standards*); and the audit requirements of Title 2 U.S. *Code of Federal Regulations* Part 200, *Uniform Administrative Requirements, Cost Principles, and Audit Requirements for Federal Awards* (Uniform Guidance). Our responsibilities under those standards and the Uniform Guidance are further described in the Auditor's Responsibilities for the Audit of Compliance section of our report.

We are required to be independent of West Michigan Shoreline Regional Development Commission and to meet our other ethical responsibilities, in accordance with relevant ethical requirements relating to our audit. We believe that the audit evidence we have obtained is sufficient and appropriate to provide a basis for our opinion on compliance for each major federal program. Our audit does not provide a legal determination of West Michigan Shoreline Regional Development Commission's compliance with the compliance requirements referred to above.

***Responsibilities of Management for Compliance***

Management is responsible for compliance with the requirements referred to above and for the design, implementation, and maintenance of effective internal control over compliance with the requirements of laws, statutes, regulations, rules and provisions of contracts or grant agreements applicable to West Michigan Shoreline Regional Development Commission's federal programs.

Board of Commissioners  
West Michigan Shoreline Regional Development Commission  
Page 2

## **Report on Compliance for Each Major Federal Program—Continued**

### ***Auditor's Responsibilities for the Audit of Compliance***

Our objectives are to obtain reasonable assurance about whether material noncompliance with the compliance requirements referred to above occurred, whether due to fraud or error, and express an opinion on West Michigan Shoreline Regional Development Commission's compliance based on our audit. Reasonable assurance is a high level of assurance but is not absolute assurance and therefore is not a guarantee that an audit conducted in accordance with GAAS, *Government Auditing Standards*, and the Uniform Guidance will always detect material noncompliance when it exists. The risk of not detecting material noncompliance resulting from fraud is higher than for that resulting from error, as fraud may involve collusion, forgery, intentional omissions, misrepresentations, or the override of internal control. Noncompliance with the compliance requirements referred to above is considered material, if there is a substantial likelihood that, individually or in the aggregate, it would influence the judgment made by a reasonable user of the report on compliance about West Michigan Shoreline Regional Development Commission's compliance with the requirements of each major federal program as a whole.

In performing an audit in accordance with GAAS, *Government Auditing Standards*, and the Uniform Guidance, we

- exercise professional judgment and maintain professional skepticism throughout the audit.
- identify and assess the risks of material noncompliance, whether due to fraud or error, and design and perform audit procedures responsive to those risks. Such procedures include examining, on a test basis, evidence regarding West Michigan Shoreline Regional Development Commission's compliance with the compliance requirements referred to above and performing such other procedures as we considered necessary in the circumstances.
- obtain an understanding of West Michigan Shoreline Regional Development Commission's internal control over compliance relevant to the audit in order to design audit procedures that are appropriate in the circumstances and to test and report on internal control over compliance in accordance with the Uniform Guidance, but not for the purpose of expressing an opinion on the effectiveness of West Michigan Shoreline Regional Development Commission's internal control over compliance. Accordingly, no such opinion is expressed.

We are required to communicate with those charged with governance regarding, among other matters, the planned scope and timing of the audit and any significant deficiencies and material weaknesses in internal control over compliance that we identified during the audit.

### **Report on Internal Control Over Compliance**

A *deficiency in internal control over compliance* exists when the design or operation of a control over compliance does not allow management or employees, in the normal course of performing their assigned functions, to prevent, or detect and correct, noncompliance with a type of compliance requirement of a federal program on a timely basis. A *material weakness in internal control over compliance* is a deficiency, or a combination of deficiencies, in internal control over compliance, such that there is a reasonable possibility that material noncompliance with a type of compliance requirement of a federal program will not be prevented, or detected and corrected, on a timely basis. A *significant deficiency in internal control over compliance* is a deficiency, or a combination of deficiencies, in internal control over compliance with a type of compliance requirement of a federal program that is less severe than a material weakness in internal control over compliance, yet important enough to merit attention by those charged with governance.

Board of Commissioners  
West Michigan Shoreline Regional Development Commission  
Page 3

**Report on Internal Control Over Compliance—Continued**

Our consideration of internal control over compliance was for the limited purpose described in the Auditor's Responsibilities for the Audit of Compliance section above and was not designed to identify all deficiencies in internal control over compliance that might be material weaknesses or significant deficiencies in internal control over compliance. Given these limitation, during our audit we did not identify any deficiencies in internal control over compliance that we consider to be material weaknesses, as defined above. However, material weaknesses or significant deficiencies in internal control over compliance may exist that were not identified.

Our audit was not designed for the purpose of expressing an opinion on the effectiveness of internal control over compliance. Accordingly, no such opinion is expressed.

The purpose of this report on internal control over compliance is solely to describe the scope of our testing of internal control over compliance and the results of that testing based on the requirements of the Uniform Guidance. Accordingly, this report is not suitable for any other purpose.

**Report on Schedule of Expenditures of Federal Awards Required by the Uniform Guidance**

We have audited the financial statements of West Michigan Shoreline Regional Development Commission as of and for the year ended September 30, 2023, and have issued our report thereon dated January 18, 2024, which contained an unmodified opinion on those financial statements. Our audit was performed for the purpose of forming an opinion on the financial statements as a whole. The accompanying Schedule of Expenditures of Federal Awards is presented for purposes of additional analysis as required by the Uniform Guidance and is not a required part of the financial statements. Such information is the responsibility of management and was derived from and relates directly to the underlying accounting and other records used to prepare the financial statements. The information has been subjected to the auditing procedures applied in the audit of the financial statements and certain additional procedures, including comparing and reconciling such information directly to the underlying accounting and other records used to prepare the financial statements or to the financial statements themselves, and other additional procedures in accordance with auditing standards generally accepted in the United States of America. In our opinion, the Schedule of Expenditures of Federal Awards is fairly stated in all material respects in relation to the financial statements as a whole.



Muskegon, Michigan  
January 18, 2024

West Michigan Shoreline Regional Development Commission  
**SCHEDULE OF EXPENDITURES OF FEDERAL AWARDS**  
For the year ended September 30, 2023

<u>Federal grantor/pass-through grantor/ program or cluster title/identifying number</u>	<u>Assistance Listing Number</u>	<u>Entitlement program or award amount</u>	<u>Accrued (unearned) revenue October 1, 2022</u>	<u>Adjustments and transfers</u>	<u>Cash or payments in kind received (cash basis)</u>	<u>Expenditures (accrual basis)</u>		<u>Accrued (unearned) revenue September 30, 2023</u>	<u>Passed through to subrecipients</u>
						<u>Prior year(s)</u>	<u>Current year</u>		
<b><i>U.S. Department of Agriculture</i></b>									
Forest Service									
Cooperative Forestry Assistance	10.664								
Passed through Muskegon River Watershed Assembly									
The Muskegon River Watershed Riparian Tree Planting (19-IA-11090100-022)		\$ 98,846	\$ 7,286	\$ -	\$ 42,635	\$ 62,469	\$ 35,349	\$ -	\$ -
<b><i>U.S. Department of Commerce</i></b>									
Economic Development Administration									
Economic Development Support for Planning Organizations	11.302								
Direct Programs									
Economic Development District Partnership Planning (ED20CHI3020005)		210,000	5,707	-	22,946	192,529	17,239	-	-
Economic Development District Partnership Planning (ED23CHI3020002)		210,000	-	-	61,889	-	64,921	3,032	-
Total Economic Development Support for Planning Organizations		420,000	5,707	-	84,835	192,529	82,160	3,032	-
Economic Development Cluster									
Economic Adjustment Assistance	11.307								
Direct Programs									
COVID-19 - CARES Act Non-Competitive EDD Planning (ED20CHI3070071)		400,000	11,347	-	33,398	377,820	22,051	-	-
Total Economic Development Administration		820,000	17,054	-	118,233	570,349	104,211	3,032	-



West Michigan Shoreline Regional Development Commission  
**SCHEDULE OF EXPENDITURES OF FEDERAL AWARDS—Continued**  
For the year ended September 30, 2023

Federal grantor/pass-through grantor/ program or cluster title/identifying number	Assistance Listing Number	Entitlement program or award amount	Accrued (unearned) revenue October 1, 2022	Adjustments and transfers	Cash or payments in kind received (cash basis)	Expenditures (accrual basis)		Accrued (unearned) revenue September 30, 2023	Passed through to subrecipients
						Prior year(s)	Current year		
<i>U.S. Department of Commerce—Continued</i>									
National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration									
Habitat Conservation	11.463								
Direct Programs									
The Lake Michigan Coastal Rivers and Wetlands Project (NA20NMF4630311)		\$ 3,755,783	\$ 41,652	\$ -	\$ 731,127	\$ 453,544	\$ 831,878	\$ 142,403	\$ 30,090
Passed through Great Lakes Commission									
Regional Partnership to Restore Habitat and Remove Beneficial Use Impairments in the U.S. and Binational Great Lakes Area of Concerns (NA16NMF4630341)		10,193,200	59,941	-	261,355	7,812,713	205,653	4,239	35,313
Regional Partnership to Restore Fish Habitat in Priority Great Lakes Coastal Sites and Areas of Concern (NA19NMF4630267)		7,160,103	10,141	-	16,195	11,780	16,392	10,338	-
Total passed through Great Lakes Commission		17,353,303	70,082	-	277,550	7,824,493	222,045	14,577	35,313
Total National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration		21,109,086	111,734	-	1,008,677	8,278,037	1,053,923	156,980	65,403
Total U.S. Department of Commerce		21,929,086	128,788	-	1,126,910	8,848,386	1,158,134	160,012	65,403
<i>U.S. Department of Transportation</i>									
Federal Highway Administration									
Highway Planning and Construction	20.205								
Passed through Michigan Department of Transportation									
FY 2022 Clean Air Action Program (2021-0012-Z5)		100,000	9,779	-	9,779	99,694	-	-	-
FY 2022 Unified Work Program (2021-0012-Z4)		368,160	45,055	-	45,055	327,755	-	-	-
FY 2023 Clean Air Action Program (2021-0012-Z8)		100,000	-	-	80,342	-	88,211	7,869	-
FY 2023 Unified Work Program (2021-0012-Z7)		455,433	-	-	322,300	-	401,612	79,312	-
FY 2023 Rural Task Force Work Program (2021-0024-Z11)		17,490	-	-	-	-	2,208	2,208	-
COVID-19 - Purchase of Non-Motorized/Pedestrian Traffic Counting Devices (2021-0012-Z9)		30,000	-	-	29,931	-	29,931	-	-
Total Highway Planning and Construction		1,071,083	54,834	-	487,407	427,449	521,962	89,389	-

West Michigan Shoreline Regional Development Commission  
**SCHEDULE OF EXPENDITURES OF FEDERAL AWARDS—Continued**  
For the year ended September 30, 2023

Federal grantor/pass-through grantor/ program or cluster title/identifying number	Assistance Listing Number	Entitlement program or award amount	Accrued (unearned) revenue October 1, 2022	Adjustments and transfers	Cash or payments in kind received (cash basis)	Expenditures (accrual basis)		Accrued (unearned) revenue September 30, 2023	Passed through to subrecipients
						Prior year(s)	Current year		
<b><i>U.S. Department of Transportation—Continued</i></b>									
Federal Transit Administration									
Metropolitan Transportation Planning and State and Non-Metropolitan Planning and Research	20.505								
Passed through Michigan Department of Transportation West Michigan Regional Transit Systems Governance and Organizational Transit Study (MI-2019-014-02)		\$ 120,000	\$ 2,688	\$ -	\$ 39,233	\$ 81,520	\$ 36,545	\$ -	\$ -
Total U.S. Department of Transportation		1,191,083	57,522	-	526,640	508,969	558,507	89,389	-
<b><i>U.S. Environmental Protection Agency</i></b>									
Office of Water									
Geographic Programs—Great Lakes Restoration Initiative	66.469								
Passed through Michigan Department of Environment, Great Lakes, and Energy, Water Resources Division Muskegon Lake AOC BUI Removal, Assessment, Public Education and Involvement Project (GL00E02481)		88,573	7,644	-	23,338	87,546	33,929	18,235	-
<b><i>U.S. Department of Homeland Security</i></b>									
Federal Emergency Management Agency									
Building Resilient Infrastructure Communities	97.047								
Passed through Michigan State Police, Emergency Management and Homeland Security Division FY19 HMA Pre-Disaster Mitigation Grant Project (EMC-2021-PC-0001)		117,938	16,829	-	50,358	44,472	45,868	12,339	-
TOTAL FEDERAL ASSISTANCE		\$ 23,425,526	\$ 218,069	\$ -	\$ 1,769,881	\$ 9,551,842	\$ 1,831,787	\$ 279,975	\$ 65,403

The accompanying notes are an integral part of this schedule.

West Michigan Shoreline Regional Development Commission  
**NOTES TO SCHEDULE OF EXPENDITURES OF FEDERAL AWARDS**  
For the year ended September 30, 2023

1. The accompanying Schedule of Expenditures of Federal Awards (the “schedule”) includes the federal award activity of the Commission under programs of the federal government for the year ended September 30, 2023. The information in this schedule is presented in accordance with the requirements of Title 2 U.S. Code of Federal Regulations Part 200, Uniform Administrative Requirements, Cost Principles, and Audit Requirements for Federal Awards (Uniform Guidance). Because the schedule presents only a selected portion of the operations of the Commission, it is not intended to and does not present the financial position or change in net position of the Commission.
2. Please see the financial statement footnotes for the significant accounting policies used in preparing this schedule. Expenditures are recognized following the cost principles contained in the Uniform Guidance, wherein certain types of expenditures are not allowable or are limited as to reimbursement. Negative amounts shown on the schedule represent adjustments or credits made in the normal course of business to amounts reported as expenditures in prior years. The Commission is not using the ten-percent de minimis indirect cost rate as allowed under the Uniform Guidance.
3. Reconciliation of revenues from federal sources per financial statements and expenditures per single audit report Schedule of Expenditures of Federal Awards.

Revenues from federal sources per September 30, 2023 financial statements	\$ 1,831,789
Rounding	<u>(2)</u>
Expenditures per single audit report Schedule of Expenditures of Federal Awards	<u><u>\$ 1,831,787</u></u>

West Michigan Shoreline Regional Development Commission  
**SCHEDULE OF FINDINGS AND QUESTIONED COSTS**  
For the year ended September 30, 2023

**SECTION I—SUMMARY OF AUDITOR’S RESULTS**

*A. Financial Statements*

1. Type of report the auditor issued on whether the financial statements audited were prepared in accordance with GAAP: Unmodified
2. Internal control over financial reporting:
  - Material weakness(es) identified? ☐ yes ☒ no
  - Significant deficiency(ies) identified? ☐ yes ☒ none reported
3. Noncompliance material to financial statements noted? ☐ yes ☒ no

*B. Federal Awards*

1. Internal control over major federal programs:
  - Material weakness(es) identified? ☐ yes ☒ no
  - Significant deficiency(ies) identified? ☐ yes ☒ none reported
2. Type of auditor’s report issued on compliance for major federal programs: Unmodified
3. Any audit findings disclosed that are required to be reported in accordance with 2 CFR 200.516(a)? ☐ yes ☒ no
4. Identification of major programs:

<u>Assistance Listing Number(s)</u>	<u>Name of Federal Program or Cluster</u>
<b>11.463</b>	<b>U.S. Department of Commerce</b>
	<b>• Habitat Conservation</b>
5. Dollar threshold used to distinguish between type A and type B programs: **\$750,000**
6. Auditee qualified as low-risk auditee? ☒ yes ☐ no

**SECTION II – FINANCIAL STATEMENT FINDINGS**

NONE

**SECTION III – FEDERAL AWARD FINDINGS AND QUESTIONED COSTS**

NONE

## **CLIENT DOCUMENTS**



## SUMMARY SCHEDULE OF PRIOR AUDIT FINDINGS

January 18, 2024

U.S. Department of Commerce, Economic Development Administration  
Washington, D.C.

West Michigan Shoreline Regional Development Commission respectfully advises you that there were ***no*** audit findings reported in our single audit report, dated January 19, 2023, for the year ended September 30, 2022.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Erin Kuhn". The signature is fluid and cursive, with a long horizontal stroke extending to the right.

Erin Kuhn  
Executive Director



## **CORRECTIVE ACTION PLAN**

January 18, 2024

U.S. Department of Commerce, Economic Development Administration  
Washington, D.C.

West Michigan Shoreline Regional Development Commission respectfully submits the following Corrective Action Plan for the year ended September 30, 2023.

Name and address of independent public accounting firm:

Brickley DeLong, P.C.  
P.O. Box 999  
Muskegon, Michigan 49443

Audit period: September 30, 2023

The findings from the Schedule of Findings and Questioned Costs for the year ended September 30, 2023 provided **no** findings in either Section II or Section III. Accordingly, there are **no** matters requiring corrective action as shown below.

### **SECTION II – FINANCIAL STATEMENT FINDINGS**

There were **no** findings in relation to the financial statement audit.

### **SECTION III – FEDERAL AWARD FINDINGS AND QUESTIONED COSTS**

There were **no** findings in relation to the major federal award programs.

If the U.S. Department of Commerce, Economic Development Administration has questions regarding this plan, please call Erin Kuhn at (231) 722-7878.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Erin Kuhn".

Erin Kuhn  
Executive Director