
Final

**Transportation Conformity Determination Report for
the 1997 Ozone NAAQS**

**Muskegon Orphan Maintenance Area
(Partial Muskegon County)**

New WestPlan 2050 Metropolitan Transportation Plan

April 19, 2024

Prepared by:
Michigan Department of Transportation
Statewide and Urban Travel Analysis Section
Van Wagoner Transportation Building
Lansing, MI 48909
WittID@Michigan.gov
517-335-4620

in cooperation with

West Michigan Shoreline Regional Development Commission (WMSRDC)
316 Morris Ave.
Muskegon, MI 49440
231-722-7878
www.wmsrdc.org

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Executive Summary 3

1.0 Background 5

 1.1 Transportation Conformity Process 5

 1.2 Conformity Area 6

 1.3 Attainment Status 6

2.0 Long-Range Transportation Plan or Metropolitan Transportation Plan 7

3.0 Transportation Improvement Program..... 8

4.0 Transportation Conformity Determination: General Process..... 9

5.0 Transportation Conformity Requirements 9

 5.1 Overview 9

 5.2 Latest Planning Assumptions 10

 5.3 Consultation Requirements..... 11

 5.4 Timely Implementation of Transportation Control Measures 11

 5.5 Fiscal Constraint..... 11

6.0 Conclusion..... 12

Appendix A: Meeting Summary of Interagency Workgroups..... 13

Appendix B: Public Comments and Responses 19

Appendix C: Projects Evaluated for Conformity 19

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

As part of its transportation planning process, West Michigan Metropolitan Transportation Planning Program (WestPlan) completed the transportation conformity process for the WestPlan 2050 Metropolitan Transportation Plan (MTP) and 2023-2026 Transportation Improvement Program (TIP). This report documents that the WestPlan 2050 MTP and associated 2023-2026 TIP, in the remaining 1997 ozone NAAQS maintenance area of Muskegon County not covered by the 2015 ozone NAAQS nonattainment area, meet the federal transportation conformity requirements in 40 CFR Part 93.

Clean Air Act (CAA) section 176(c) (42 U.S.C. 7506(c)) requires federally funded or approved highway and transit activities are consistent with (“conform to”) the purpose of the State Implementation Plan (SIP). Conformity to the purpose of the SIP means that transportation activities will not cause or contribute to new air quality violations, worsen existing violations, or delay timely attainment of the relevant National Ambient Air Quality Standard (NAAQS) or any interim milestones. 42 U.S.C. 7506(c)(1). The United States Environmental Protection Agency’s (EPA) transportation conformity rules establish the criteria and procedures for determining whether Metropolitan Transportation Plan (MTPs), TIPs, and federally supported highway and transit projects conform to the SIP, 40 CFR Parts 51.390 and 93.

On Feb. 16, 2018, the United States Court of Appeals for the District of Columbia Circuit in *South Coast Air Quality Mgmt. District v. EPA* (“*South Coast II*,” 882 F.3d 1138) held that transportation conformity determinations must be made in areas that were either nonattainment or maintenance for the 1997 ozone NAAQS and attainment for the 2008 ozone NAAQS when the 1997 ozone NAAQS was revoked. These conformity determinations were required in these areas after Feb. 16, 2019. Muskegon County was in maintenance at the time of the 1997 ozone NAAQS revocation on April 6, 2015, and was also designated attainment for the 2008 ozone NAAQS on May 21, 2012. The western part of the county was designated nonattainment for the 2015 ozone NAAQS on Aug. 3, 2018.

Therefore, per the *South Coast II* decision, this conformity determination on the MTP and TIP is being made for the remaining maintenance area of the 1997 ozone NAAQS in Muskegon County.

This conformity determination was completed consistent with CAA requirements, existing associated regulations at 40 CFR Parts 51.390 and 93, and the *South Coast II* decision, according to EPA's *Transportation Conformity Guidance for the South Coast II Court Decision* issued on Nov. 29, 2018.

1.0 BACKGROUND

1.1 TRANSPORTATION CONFORMITY PROCESS

The concept of transportation conformity was introduced in the CAA of 1977, which included a provision to ensure that transportation investments conform to a SIP for meeting the federal air quality standards. Conformity requirements were made substantially more rigorous in the CAA Amendments of 1990. The transportation conformity regulations that detail implementation of the CAA requirements were first issued in November 1993 and have been amended several times. The regulations establish the criteria and procedures for transportation agencies to demonstrate that air pollutant emissions from MTPs, TIPs, and projects are consistent with (“conform to”) the state’s air quality goals in the SIP.

Transportation conformity is required under CAA Section 176(c) to ensure that federally supported transportation activities are consistent with (“conform to”) the purpose of a state’s SIP. Transportation conformity establishes the framework for improving air quality to protect public health and the environment. Conformity to the purpose of the SIP means Federal Highway Administration (FHWA) and Federal Transit Administration (FTA) funding and approvals are given to highway and transit activities that will not cause new air quality violations, worsen existing air quality violations, or delay timely attainment of the relevant air quality standard, or any interim milestone.

1.2 CONFORMITY AREA

The conformity area consists of the remaining 1997 ozone NAAQS maintenance area of Muskegon County, that area not covered by the 2015 ozone NAAQS nonattainment area. The area consists of seven townships in Muskegon County, Holton, Cedar Creek, Egelston, Moorland, Casnovia, Sullivan, and Ravenna all within the boundary of the metropolitan planning organizations (MPO) of WestPlan.

Findings of this transportation conformity report are for transportation activities contained within the conformity area.

1.3 ATTAINMENT STATUS

On April 15, 2004, the EPA issued final designations of areas not attaining the 1997 ozone NAAQS (also referred to as 1997 ozone standard). Muskegon County was designated a nonattainment area.

On May 16, 2007, the EPA redesignated the area attainment, approving and finding adequate motor vehicle emissions budgets (MVEB) for volatile organic compounds (VOC) and nitrogen oxides (NO_x) for the year 2018. The area was placed into maintenance; this requires conformity emissions to be compared to the motor vehicle emission budgets contained in the SIP.

On July 20, 2012, the EPA designated all of Michigan as attainment for the strengthened 2008 ozone NAAQS.

On July 20, 2013, the EPA partially revoked the 1997 ozone NAAQS, revoking the requirement to do transportation conformity for areas that were in maintenance.

On April 6, 2015, the EPA completely revoked the 1997 ozone NAAQS, which resulted in removal of all transportation conformity requirements.

On April 23, 2018, FHWA began requiring areas in the country to conduct conformity if they were a maintenance area for the 1997 ozone NAAQS and attainment for the 2008 ozone NAAQS when the 1997 ozone NAAQS was revoked. This was to comply with the court's decision in *South Coast II*. The Muskegon County maintenance area was one of these areas. Later, this was amended to require MPOs to have a conformity in place on Feb. 16, 2019, and conduct conformity going forward.

On Aug. 3, 2018, the EPA designated the western part of Muskegon County a nonattainment area for the strengthened 2015 ozone NAAQS. However, conformity was required to be conducted for the whole county because the MVEBs were for the whole county.

On Nov. 7, 2022, the Muskegon County 2015 ozone nonattainment area (partial county) was reclassified by EPA from marginal to moderate for failure to attain the NAAQS by Aug. 3, 2021. MVEBs for the 2015 ozone partial county nonattainment area were developed and will be used once approved by EPA.

In 2024, the EPA approved the MVEBs for the Muskegon Partial County 2015 Ozone Nonattainment Area. With these budgets approved, the emissions analysis will include only the partial county nonattainment area. This qualitative report will cover the remaining 1997 ozone maintenance area in Muskegon County.

2.0 LONG-RANGE TRANSPORTATION PLAN OR METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION PLAN

The LRTP, also referred to as an MTP, is developed by the MPO to establish a long-term transportation plan. An MTP is federally required for MPOs to receive federal funding and must provide a 20-year (or longer) horizon. Plans are required to be updated every four to five years. The purpose of an MTP is to assess future needs of the area's transportation system and set goals to meet those needs. The planning process can enhance quality of life by

fostering the mobility of people and freight in an effective and safe method.

Findings of the transportation conformity report are for transportation activities contained within the conformity area. WestPlan is developing a new 2050 MTP. This conformity report is to ensure that the part of WestPlan in the remaining 1997 ozone maintenance area in Muskegon County satisfies its obligation to the CAA. This report also includes the TIP. This report evaluates transportation activities contained in:

- WestPlan 2050 MTP in the eastern part of Muskegon County, and
- WestPlan 2023-2026 TIP in the eastern part of Muskegon County.

3.0 TRANSPORTATION IMPROVEMENT PROGRAM

The TIP is a financially constrained four-year program covering the most immediate implementation priorities for transportation projects and strategies from the MTP.

The TIP identifies proposed projects developed by local agencies in accordance with the joint regulations of the FHWA and the FTA. These regulations establish the TIP as the programming phase of the overall continuing, comprehensive, and cooperative planning process. This planning process includes local jurisdictions, transit agencies, and state and federal transportation officials.

A conformity analysis for the Muskegon County maintenance area, the whole county, was conducted on the 2023-2026 TIPs and associated MTPs receiving a letter supporting the conformity findings from FHWA/FTA on Sep. 30, 2022.

4.0 TRANSPORTATION CONFORMITY DETERMINATION: GENERAL PROCESS

Per the court's decision in *South Coast II*, beginning Feb. 16, 2019, a transportation conformity determination for the 1997 ozone NAAQS will be needed in 1997 ozone NAAQS nonattainment and maintenance areas identified by EPA¹ for certain transportation activities, including updated or amended MTPs and TIPs. FHWA/FTA made its initial 1997 ozone and 2015 ozone NAAQS conformity determinations for the 2040 LRTP and 2017-2020 TIP on May 30, 2019. Conformity will now be required no less frequently than every four years. The current conformity determination report will address transportation conformity for the new WestPlan 2050 MTP and 2023-2026 TIP contained in the remaining 1997 ozone maintenance area, which is not part of the 2015 ozone nonattainment area, in Muskegon County.

5.0 TRANSPORTATION CONFORMITY REQUIREMENTS

5.1 OVERVIEW

On Nov. 29, 2018, EPA issued the **Transportation Conformity Guidance for the South Coast II Court Decision**² (EPA-420-B-18-050, November 2018) that addresses how transportation conformity determinations can be made in areas that were nonattainment or maintenance for the 1997 ozone NAAQS when the 1997 ozone NAAQS was revoked but were designated attainment for the 2008 ozone NAAQS in EPA's original designations for this NAAQS (May 21, 2012). The area was designated attainment for the 2008 ozone NAAQS on May 21, 2012, and Aug. 3, 2018, for the 2015 ozone NAAQS.

The transportation conformity regulation at 40 CFR 93.109 sets forth the criteria and procedures for determining conformity. The conformity criteria for MTPs and TIPs includes latest planning

¹ The areas identified can be found in EPA's "Transportation Conformity Guidance for the South Coast II Court Decision," EPA-420-B-18-050, available at <https://nepis.epa.gov/Exe/ZyPDF.cgi?Dockkey=P100VQME.pdf>.

² Available from <https://www.epa.gov/sites/production/files/2018-11/documents/420b18050.pdf>.

assumptions (93.110), latest emissions model (93.111), consultation (93.112), transportation control measures (93.113(b) and (c)), and emissions budget and/or interim emissions (93.118 and/or 93.119).

For the 1997 ozone NAAQS areas, transportation conformity for MTPs and TIPs for the 1997 ozone NAAQS can be demonstrated without a regional emissions analysis, per 40 CFR 93.109(c). This provision states that the regional emissions analysis requirement applies one year after the effective date of EPA's nonattainment designation for a NAAQS and until the effective date of revocation of such NAAQS for an area. The 1997 ozone NAAQS revocation was effective on April 6, 2015, and the *South Coast II* court upheld the revocation. As no regional emission analysis is required for this conformity determination, there is no requirement to use the latest emissions model, or budget or interim emissions tests.

Therefore, transportation conformity for the 1997 ozone NAAQS maintenance area in Muskegon County for the WestPlan 2050 MTP and 2023-2026 TIP can be demonstrated by showing the remaining requirements in Table 1 in 40 CFR 93.109 have been met. These requirements, which are laid out in Section 2.4 of EPA's guidance and addressed below, include:

- Latest planning assumptions (93.110),
- Consultation (93.112),
- Transportation Control Measures (93.113), and
- Fiscal constraint (93.108).

5.2 LATEST PLANNING ASSUMPTIONS

The use of latest planning assumptions in 40 CFR 93.110 of the conformity rule generally apply to regional emissions analysis. In the 1997 ozone NAAQS areas, the use of the latest planning assumptions requirement applies to assumptions about transportation control measures (TCMs) in an approved SIP.

The Michigan SIP does not include any TCMs (see also Section 5.4).

5.3 CONSULTATION REQUIREMENTS

The consultation requirements in 40 CFR 93.112 were addressed both for interagency consultation and public consultation.

Interagency consultation was conducted with WestPlan, MACC, GVMC, the Michigan Department of Transportation (MDOT), the Michigan Department of Environment, Great Lakes, and Energy (EGLE), FHWA, FTA, and EPA. A summary of the Michigan Transportation Interagency Workgroup (MITC-IAWG) meeting on Oct. 26, 2023, and relevant interagency consultation correspondence related to this conformity is in Appendix A. Interagency consultation was conducted consistent with Michigan's conformity SIP.

Public consultation will be conducted consistent with planning rule requirements in 23 CFR 450. The Public Participation Plan adopted by the MPO policy committee establishes the procedures by which the MPOs reach affected public agencies and the public. The same procedures were followed for this document, ensuring the public has an opportunity to review and comment before the MPO's policy committee makes a determination.

A formal public comment period for a draft of this conformity report was held arch 28 through April 17, 2024. Public comments received and responses to those comments are in Appendix B.

The WestPlan policy committee made a formal conformity determination through a resolution on April 17, 2024.

5.4 TIMELY IMPLEMENTATION OF TRANSPORTATION CONTROL MEASURES

The Michigan SIP does not include any TCMs.

5.5 FISCAL CONSTRAINT

Transportation conformity requirements in 40 CFR 93.108 state that transportation plans and TIPs must be fiscally constrained

consistent with the metropolitan planning regulations at 23 CFR part 450. The MTP and 2023-2026 TIP are fiscally constrained, as demonstrated in:

- WestPlan 2050 MTP, Chapter 13 Financial Resources Analysis, and
- WestPlan 2023-2026 TIP, Financial Analysis.

6.0 CONCLUSION

The conformity determination process completed for the WestPlan 2050 MTP and 2023-2026 TIP demonstrates that these planning documents meet the CAA and transportation conformity rule requirements for the 1997 ozone NAAQS.

Appendix A: Meeting Summary of Interagency Workgroups

Meeting Summary

Michigan Transportation Conformity Interagency Workgroup (MITC-IAWG) for:

**Allegan County 2015 Ozone Nonattainment Area and 1997 Ozone Maintenance Area,
Muskegon County 2015 Ozone Nonattainment Area and 1997 Ozone Maintenance Area**

For new 2050 Long-Range Transportation Plans

Teams Meeting: 1-2 p.m. Oct. 26, 2023

Members and partners attended by video conference by Teams.

In attendance:

Agency	Name
Federal Highway Administration (FHWA)	Christina Nicholaides
Federal Transit Administration (FTA)	Kathleen Russell
Michigan Department of Environment, Great Lakes, and Energy (EGLE)	Breanna Bukowski
Michigan Department of Transportation (MDOT) Conformity	Donna Wittl
Macatawa Area Coordinating Council (MACC)	Alec Miller and Eric Dykstra
West Michigan Metropolitan Transportation Planning Program (WestPlan)	Brian Mulnix, Joel Fitzpatrick and Robert Johnson
MDOT Program Manager MACC, WestPlan	Luke Walters
MDOT Grand Region	Dennis Kent
MDOT project level	Lane Masoud
MDOT travel demand modeling, GVMC	Daniela Khavajian
MDOT travel demand modeling, WestPlan	Ryan Gladding
MDOT Office of Passenger Transportation (OPT) Allegan County	Fred Featherly
MDOT OPT Muskegon and Ottawa counties	Tina Hawley
MDOT	Sam Hetherington

Note: March 2024: required modifications affecting WestPlan new 2050 MTP. The Allegan County

emissions analysis for the MACC 2050 LRTP is completed and not affected. Partial county motor vehicle emission budgets are being approved by the US Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) and published in the federal register and will need to be used for subsequent conformity analyses. The emissions analysis for the WestPlan new 2050 MTP will need to use the new budgets and will cover only the partial county 2015 ozone nonattainment area. The analysis year of 2023 has passed, so it will be replaced with year 2025. Local 2019 meteorology data will be used. The remaining area of the county in the 1997 ozone maintenance area will require a qualitative report.

Welcome and introductions:

The group was welcomed to the MITC-IAWG to review projects and modeling for air quality for the new 2050 LRTP for the MACC and 2050 MTP for WestPlan. It was explained because these are nonattainment areas, the IAWG must be done by a teleconference or videoconference. Attendance was determined by participants listed by Teams in the call. GVMC staff was invited to the meeting but was unable to attend. They are being included to keep the cohesion among the groups and some of the projects being reviewed are in Ottawa County.

Conformity documents:

It was explained that each of the four documents listed below would be needed. Depending on the timing of WestPlan’s new 2050 MTP, the projects for GVMC might be included in the same report.

- a. Allegan County: New 2050 MACC LRTP - requires emission analysis.
- b. Muskegon County: New 2050 WestPlan MTP - requires emission analysis.
- c. Kent-Ottawa County Limited Orphan Maintenance Area (LOMA) New 2050 MACC LRTP in Ottawa County - conformity report (no analysis).
- d. Kent-Ottawa County LOMA New 2050 WestPlan MTP in Ottawa County - conformity report (no analysis).

Allegan County analysis years:

- 2019 base year of MACC travel demand model
- 2023 attainment year of 2015 ozone NAAQS - moderate
(Must attain standard by Aug. 3, 2024)
- 2025 interim analysis year
- 2035 interim analysis year
- 2045 interim analysis year
- 2050 last year of LRTP

A question was asked why year 2025 was needed. Interim analysis years can’t have more than 10 years between them.

Muskegon County analysis years:

- 2019 base year of WestPlan travel demand model
- 2023 attainment year of 2015 ozone NAAQS - moderate
(Must attain standard by Aug. 3, 2024)
- 2030 interim analysis year
- 2040 interim analysis year

2050 last year of MTP

It was explained that the analysis years can be different since the two nonattainment areas don't have any overlapping area requiring emission modeling.

Project review:

Project lists were sent with the agenda. It was explained that non-exempt projects are highlighted in yellow and would be modeled. Orange highlights were projects requiring discussion. Many projects were listed as exempt but will be modeled; these are indicated on the lists. It was explained that it is better to have all projects reviewed by the IAWG so there is a record. The environmental process finds it beneficial to have a record even if the project is exempt.

Project list for MACC:

The MACC sent two nonmotorized pathway projects that were added to the final list as exempt projects. The group discussed the College Avenue new road extension; given its proposed configuration, it was deemed exempt. The group agreed with all project classifications as listed.

Project list for WestPlan:

WestPlan explained that they were only having their expand list reviewed. An MDOT project on US-31 in Grand Haven was brought to the group at the meeting. The group discussed the project and established an appropriate description and price, and determined it was non-exempt to be modeled in 2050. The group discussed the Walker Road project and determined it to be exempt and will not be modeled. The group agreed with all project classifications as listed.

Projects for Rural STIP: No changes from last amendment.

Modeling:

Travel demand models:

- a. MACC and WestPlan travel demand models will be updated to base year 2019.
- b. Statewide travel demand model will have a base year 2015; used for rural areas of Allegan County.

Emission model: Motor Vehicle Emissions Simulator (MOVES3.1) will be used.

Budgets: The 1997 ozone maintenance budgets for each county will be used.

Meteorology data: After the call, there was a consultation with EPA and it was determined that data used to create the budgets should be used for the analysis. Default MOVES data should be used because that was the data used for 1997 ozone maintenance SIPs.

Speeds: Average speed by MOVES road types per time period will be used.

Vehicle population and age distribution: Both will be updated to year 2019 (Secretary of State registration data on July 1).

Combination trucks: 2019 data is unavailable from the SOS for this analysis. The 2015 data will be used assuming year 2015 is year 2019 for vehicle population and age distribution for Allegan County analysis. The same method will be used for Muskegon if data is still not available.

Default data used in MOVES: starts, hoteling, idling, fuel, hour VMT fraction.

Public comment period:

- a. MACC: Jan. 2 - 17, 2024. Later changed to Jan. 4 - Feb. 26, 2024
- b. WestPlan: Dates still uncertain, maybe as early as February 2024.

Formal resolution from MACC supporting findings: Feb. 26, 2024.

MACC: New determination letter from FHWA needed by April 30, 2024; last LRTP letter dated April 30, 2020.

Formal resolution from WestPlan supporting findings: Date still uncertain.

WestPlan: New determination letter from FHWA needed by June 5, 2024; last MTP letter dated June 5, 2020.

Other items: It was mentioned the 2015 Ozone National Ambient Air Quality Standard Moderate Element Attainment State Implementation Plan was submitted to EPA on Oct. 16, 2023. It appears at this time the budgets will not be approved in time for these two analyses. This is important because the 2015 ozone budgets represent partial county areas, and the 1997 ozone budgets are for the whole county. A second MITC-IAWG was held to review a project in the MACC MPO area; see below.

Meeting Summary
Michigan Transportation Conformity Interagency Workgroup (MITC-IAWG)
for:
Allegan County 2015 Ozone Nonattainment Area and 1997 Ozone Maintenance Area,
Muskegon County 2015 Ozone Nonattainment Area and 1997 Ozone Maintenance Area

For new 2050 Long-Range Transportation Plans

E-mail Meeting: Dec. 5, 2023

An MITC-IAWG was conducted by e-mail and requesting that a non-exempt project, center turn lane of 1.137 could be added to the MACC modeling for Allegan County and a conference call was not necessary. The group concurred with the request and the project was added to the travel demand model for year 2025. The e-mail requesting concurrence is on the following page. Project

was added to MACC list of projects.

Members and partners concurring:

Agency	Name
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (EPA)	Michael Leslie
Federal Highway Administration (FHWA)	Christina Nicholaides
Federal Transit Administration (FTA)	Kathleen Russell
Michigan Department of Environment, Great Lakes, and Energy (EGLE)	Breanna Bukowski
Michigan Department of Transportation (MDOT) Conformity	Donna Wittl
Macatawa Area Coordinating Council (MACC)	Alec Miller
West Michigan Metropolitan Transportation Planning Program (WestPlan)	Robert Johnson
MDOT Program Manager MACC, WestPlan	Luke Walters
MDOT Grand Region	Tyler Kent
Grand Valley Metro Council (GVMC)	Mike Zonyk and Laurel Joseph
MDOT Office of Passenger Transportation (OPT) Muskegon and Ottawa counties	Tina Hawley

Wittl, Donna (MDOT)

From: Wittl, Donna (MDOT)
Sent: Tuesday, December 5, 2023 12:21 PM
To: leslie.michael@epa.gov; Weber, Susan (FTA); Bukowski, Breanna (EGLE); Walters, Luke (MDOT); rjohnson@wmsrdc.org; bmulnix; jfitzpatrick@wmsrdc.org; andrea.faber@gvmc.org; Laurel Joseph; George Yang; Michael Zonyk (GVMC); Kloha, Mark (MDOT); Kent, Tyler (MDOT); Kent, Dennis (MDOT); Loehle, William (MDOT); Rozema, Susan (MDOT); Khavajian, Daniela (MDOT); Gladding, Ryan (MDOT); Roberts, Jonathan (MDOT); Featherly, Fred (MDOT); Jason Latham; Alec Miller; Eric Dykstra (MACC); Masoud, Lane (MDOT); Shultz, Valerie (MDOT); c.nicholaides@dot.gov; Kathleen.russell@dot.gov; Hawley, Tina (MDOT)
Cc: Hetherington, Samuel (MDOT)
Subject: Additional Project review for MITC-IAWG MACC New 2050 LRTP and TIP
Attachments: MACC TIP Project IAWG Review.xls

Final

Greetings MITC-IAWG Members and Partners for:

Allegan County Nonattainment Area
Muskegon County Nonattainment Area
Grand Rapids Limited Orphan Maintenance Area

The project in the attached file, is in Allegan County and the CON phase for a center-left turn lane for 1.137 miles. The project is being expanded from its previous length of 0.5 miles which was reviewed by the group for the new 2023 to 2026 TIP and thus in the TIP. The project was deemed exempt but is being modeled in the emission analysis for the new 2050 LRTP. Projects classified as exempt are modeled if they can be in the next conformity analysis. Because the project is being expanded to over 1 mile the project would now be considered non-exempt and the expanded length added to the current analysis.

The policies adopted by the group require a call to discuss non-exempt projects but given a call was held to discuss the modeling and emission analysis years, would like to forgo this because the decision is if the project is exempt or non-exempt.

Please, review the project and reply to this email with "concur" if in agreement with the recommendations: the project will be added to the current analysis as non-exempt, and no call required. If not in agreement respond accordingly and explain why. Please use "reply to all." **Responses due by Wednesday December 13, 2023.**

Clarification or questions on the project can be directed to me or the group.

Thank you for your participation,
Donna

Donna Wittl
Air Quality Conformity Specialist
Statewide & Urban Travel Analysis Section
Michigan Department of Transportation
517-335-4620
WittlD@Michigan.gov

Appendix B: Public Comments and Responses

No comments were received.

Appendix C: Projects Evaluated for Conformity

Attached are the projects evaluated for WestPlan at the Oct. 26,2023 MITC-IAWG.

The list of projects starts on following page.

MITC-IAWG WestPlan 2050 Metropolitan Transportation Plan Project List

Project Name	To/From	Description	Jurisdiction	Cost	Est. Year of	Project Length	Air Quality	Air Quality Comment
Henry Street	Seminole to Hile	Reconstruct from 2 to 3 lanes	Norton Shores	\$1,600,000	2045	1.25 miles	non-exempt	modeled
Sternberg Road	Quarterline Road to Sheridan	Add center left turn lane – 1 mile	MCRC	\$800,000	2030	1 mile	exempt	modeled
Witham Road	Bear Creek Bridge to Moulton Road	Reconstruct and add left turn lane and storm sewer – 2000 feet	North Muskegon	\$670,000	2040	2,000 feet	exempt	less than 0.5 of a mile (0.379 of a mile)
Sternberg Road	Martin Road to Lake Harbor Road	New two-lane road – 2 miles	Norton Shores	\$2,200,000	2045	2 miles	non-exempt	modeled
Pontaluna Road	Grand Haven Road to Harvey	Reconstruct from 2 to 3 lanes - .75 miles, with bike lanes	Norton Shores	\$1,600,000	2045	.75 miles	exempt	modeled
Grand Haven Road	Hile to 100 ft south of Seaway	Reconstruct from 2 to 3 Lanes.	Norton Shores	\$1,100,000	2045	.75 miles	exempt	modeled
Hile Road	Harvey Street to Grand Haven Road (excludes US- 31 bridge)	Reconstruct from 2 to 3 lanes with bike lanes	Norton Shores	\$1,600,000	2045	.75 miles	exempt	modeled
West Spring Lake Road Bridge	Lake Road to 168 th Avenue	Reconstruct bridge structure	City of Ferrysburg	\$13,000,000	2025	447 ft.	exempt	not modeled
112th Avenue/Cleveland Street intersection	Roundabout	Roundabout	Ottawa County Road Commission	\$1,300,000	2035	NA	exempt	modeled
120th Avenue/Fillmore Street intersection	Roundabout	Roundabout	Ottawa County Road Commission	\$1,300,000	2035	NA	exempt	modeled
144 th Avenue	Lincoln Street to Mercury Dr	Reconstruct to 3 lanes	Ottawa County Road Commission	\$3,000,000	2035	1.7 miles	non-exempt	modeled
168 th Avenue	Hayes to N Comstock	Reconstruct to 3 lanes	Ottawa County Road Commission	\$1,400,000	2035	.75 miles	exempt	modeled
174th	Van Wagener to Wilson Street	Reconstruct to 3 lanes	Ottawa County Road Commission	\$2,700,000	2035	1.5 miles	non-exempt	modeled
Apple Drive/3 rd Street/ Fruitport Rd intersection	Roundabout	Roundabout	Ottawa County Road Commission	\$1,300,000	2035	NA	exempt	modeled
Mercury Drive/Groesbeck St intersection	Roundabout	Roundabout	Ottawa County Road Commission	\$1,300,000	2035	NA	exempt	modeled
Mercury Drive/Comstock St intersection	Roundabout	Roundabout	Ottawa County Road Commission	\$1,300,000	2035	NA	exempt	modeled
Mercury Drive/Robbins Rd intersection	Roundabout	Roundabout	Ottawa County Road Commission	\$1,300,000	2035	NA	exempt	modeled
Whitehall Road	Giles Road to Tyler Road	Add center left turn lane. 2030.	Muskegon County Road Commission	\$2,000,000	2030	3 miles	non-exempt	modeled
Walker Rd	Mt. Garfield to Farr	New road, two lanes,	Muskegon County Road Commission	\$750,000	2030	.5 miles	exempt	road not in travel demand model. Not regionally significant. Not modeled
Dangl Road	Heights Ravenna Road to Cline Road	Add center left turn lane	Muskegon County Road Commission	\$800,000	2030	1 mile	exempt	modeled
Sternberg Roundabout	Sternberg and Airline	Roundabout	Muskegon County Road Commission	\$1,300,000	2030	NA	exempt	modeled
US-31	Franklin Street to Jackson Street	Reconstruct and add right and left turn lanes and other operational improvements	MDOT	\$6,000,000	2050	0.6	non-exempt	Modeled. Ottawa County. JN 88877 and 105534

Public transit is an important transportation mode in our community. The public transit agencies in the MPO operate services within the financial constraints presented and, like the road agencies, are continually seeking opportunities to improve and to secure additional resources where available. Current and future transit studies will help to identify specific projects.